

REMARKS

Claim 31 has been amended to call for monitoring the one video transmission for a predetermined time associated with an event being broadcast. None of the cited references do this. The office action concedes that the primary references fail to do so and relies on Knudson as teaching monitoring a time remaining.

However, Knudson monitors the time remaining on a program guide, not through the television program itself. There simply is no way for the program guide to reliably know how much time is remaining in the program. No explanation is given for how Knudson does this. For example, if the game starts at 2:00, depending on how many time outs are taken, how many times the clock is stopped, and perhaps other events, the ending time can vary. But all Knudson says is that there is displayed on the programming guide the time remaining. There is no indication of how this could possibly be done other than receiving information from a person and merely posting it.

In contrast, the claim now calls for determining from the program itself a time associated with the event. Thus, none of the cited references or their combination teaches the claimed invention.

Therefore, claims 32-34 should now be in condition for allowance.


Claim 42 calls for monitoring on a first receiver one video transmission while the first receiver is tuned to another video transmission. A notification is generated from the first receiver when a predetermined score is detected during said video transmission.

In contrast, De Saint Marc detects a goal, not a predetermined score. Therefore, the combination of De Saint Marc and Cragun fails to meet the claim limitations. As a result, claim 42, its dependent claims, as well as claims 45-50, should now be in condition for allowance.

With respect to the request for information about the priority of the two applications, the same request has already been responded to in a previous reply.

Respectfully submitted,

Date: October 30, 2003



Timothy N. Trop, Reg. No. 28,994
TROP, PRUNER & HU, P.C.
8554 Katy Freeway, Ste. 100
Houston, TX 77024
713/468-8880 [Phone]
713/468-8883 [Fax]